

Minutes of Special Call Meeting
Sanford Historic Preservation Commission
Buggy Building 6:00 PM Monday, October 10, 2016

Roll Call:

Commissioners Present: Brian Mitchell, Philip Yarborough, Allen Gordon, Greg Stoch, Tracy Hughes & David Nestor

Commissioners Absent: Jenks Youngblood

Staff Present: Liz Whitmore, Anne Sears, Secretary to the Board, City Attorney, Susan Patterson

Government Official Present: N/A

Guests: Fedd Walker, Facilities/Beautification Administrator

1. Chair David Nestor called the meeting to order and staff Anne Sears called the roll. A quorum was determined.
2. **Approval of the Agenda for October 10, 2016:** Chair Nestor called for the approval of the agenda. Commissioner Allen Gordon moved to approve the agenda, seconded by; commissioner Brian Mitchell and it passed unanimously.
3. Approval of Minutes: N/A:
4. **Public Comment: N/A**
Chair David Nestor asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Staff Liz Whitmore and Facilities/Beautification Administrator for the city, Fedd Walker was sworn in.
5. **Public Hearings: N/A**
 - a. COA-16-42-read by staff Liz Whitmore that an application was made by the City of Sanford, property owner of Horner Square parking lot located adjacent to Horner Boulevard who wish to install three (3) Trident Maples, with tree grates, ~~the~~ lights will be spaced consistently in the island, ~~and~~ brick bands will run around the interior of the island. ~~The B~~brick bands ~~that are proposed and will be installed dividing the island into three equal segments.~~ ~~will be installed dividing the island into three equal segments.~~ Staff Whitmore stated at the September 26th meeting that a minor COA for the City of Sanford was approved on September 21st for the six trees that were taken out.

In accordance with General Statutes the public hearing was advertised once a week for two successive calendars weeks prior to the meeting date and all public notifications have been fulfilled.

- Staff Whitmore stated on page two; it speaks about the guidelines that are important to the case: (Landscape Plantings 4A) states that they should consist of planting materials that are compatible with and appropriate for the urban environment and the Trident Maple is appropriate for that area. Staff noted that she did have concerns pertaining to the proposed planting of ~~the~~ said trees. ~~She~~ stated for a viable tree planting environment, it is recommended that tree grates not be used and the concrete area should be reduced. Staff asked everyone to look at (Exhibit-F) on page 8. It shows ~~that~~ the ~~existing~~ landscaping island that is ~~there now and prior to the tree removal.~~ ~~there now and there was no existing concrete.~~ ~~before the trees were removed it did not have any concrete there at all.~~ She stated that they would like to see a metal edge be placed around the tree and planted with Liriope Spicata (Monkey grass) within the metal edges, instead of tree grates. (See Exhibits B and C on pages 5 and 6. Staff noted on page 7 (Exhibit E) ~~E~~east planting island ~~there~~ is a Fed-Ex and a Post Office Box and we would like to recommend having it planted with ornamental grasses. Staff stated that on page six, (Exhibit D) shows the plantings that are there now near Horner. They ~~ar~~have not ~~in good~~

Formatted: Font color: Auto

Formatted: Font color: Auto

Formatted: Font color: Auto

~~shape and haven't~~ been maintained; because of the Streetscape construction and maintenance has gone by the wayside, all the construction going on at this time. Staff said by placing these plantings here it would help with the run-off on this site; since it was not paved to begin with; ~~so~~ it would go from 100 percent pervious area to 97 percent impervious area, so this is one reason we would like to see the liriopse ~~put~~ implanted and not use the tree grates and then the brick band around the edge. Staff Whitmore ~~she~~ said she had already spoken about planting the ornamental grasses in Exhibit D. Staff asked everyone to go to page four, this is what the trees looked like before they were taken down, ~~and on page 4,~~ Exhibit A2 ~~it~~ shows how well and how large the trees had become. ~~On page 5 (~~ Exhibit (A3 June 2016) shows an aerial of the parking lot in June of 2016, and then on (Exhibit B) page five shows ~~how~~ the ~~(~~Liriope Spicata-Monkey Grass) that is being recommended, ~~could be planted.~~ ~~On page six (Exhibit C) metal edge would be the same planted with Begonias the same size as a tree grate 5 x 5. On page 9 is the ornamental (Exhibit G) Pink Mulhy Grass that is being recommended to be planted at the east end of the island, is what is shown and planted at the other end of the parking lot.~~ Staff stated that she has spoken with Amy McNeil, Planning Design Review Coordinator, and this is not a new parking lot and the parking lot was put in before there was any landscaping requirement and the city choose at that time to put in six trees. So if they were they were going to put in a landscape parking island in now, they would have to comply with the UDO, and I understand they don't have to comply with the UDO; but she thinks it should be considered. (It is not a new parking lot) Staff stated why they did not have to apply with the UDO is because the parking lot was existing, prior to the landscaping requirement. Requirements came in after the parking lot was there. (grandfathered.) Staff did note that if you live in the historic district and when a tree is taken out; they like to be sure they replant a tree. ~~Staff Whitmore shared that Amy McNeil, Design Review Planner for the city has asked other developers to come before her; before any plantings and according to her we do not have to comply.~~ Fedd Walker relayed what we are proposing is less pervious from our standpoint. He stated we are trying to match Streetscape as much as possible, as well as lower maintenance and lower cost. Staff Whitmore comments ~~ed were that being so~~ that the City of Sanford is Tree City USA and we just won the award for the Outstanding Project of the N. C. Urban Forestry Council. ~~Staff stated from an enviro is that what we are saying from a design and environmental standpoint and from the Historic Preservation standpoint is that~~ the city removed six mature oak trees; and they are going to replace them with three trident maples. Staff shared that the Trident will do very well in the urban environment, ~~and her concern is not that t~~ The point she is trying to get across is that the previous trees and landscape islands were 100% pervious and once with the Trident Maples, the concrete and the tree grates are installed, the planting island will ~~we will only be 97 % pervious.~~ Staff Whitmore added that their recommendation are not to install tree grates are to have the three tree grates removed and install metal edging put in with the same dimension, as the tree grates and underplant ~~with Liriope planted th at the east end of the island at the Fed-X box and mailbox locations, ere under the three trees, and at the Fed-X box location.~~ She recommends Pink Mulhy Grass planted, she would like to have Pink Mulhy Grass planted there. Technically the removal of those six trees were supposed to be a Major. Staff Whitmore stated that she would like to see three extra trees planted in Depot Park, possibly in the three corners wherein the fountain area to provide shade, is to provide shade. Staff relayed that there are 762 parking spaces according to the UDO, and they would have to supply one large trees every 20 spaces or two small trees every 20 spaces and eight small shrubs for 20 parking spaces. So they would be require to plant three large trees or six small trees and twenty-one small shrubs. She stated if this was too happen; she feels like this amount would be too much. plant materials. ~~At this time,~~ staff asked everyone to look at page 13, ~~(~~ Six mature oak trees were removed, 3three Trident maples are the proposed plantings, they ~~should be (3) 3three~~ inches in caliper at the time of installation and three (3) additional trees should be dedicated to being planted on public property in an appropriate location (preferably the (3) three corners in the area of the fountain of Depot Park.) It is noted that the UDO requires 150 square feet be allowed for tree planting and shrub plantings, the five by five planting areas for the trees with no grates is 75 square feet and the east island would approximately be another 75 square feet which would equal the Unified Development Ordinance of 150 square feet for plantings of trees.) Comments of staff only.

- Commissioners continued to discuss pros and cons. Questions and comments and examples were shared by the commission and Mr. Walker and they are as follows:
- Chair Nestor asked commissioners to look at page 4, (Exhibit A.) He stated this is the Horner Square parking lot sign.

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 10 pt
Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.5", Line spacing: Multiple 1.08 li, No bullets or numbering

- Commissioner Stoch asked how much maintainance was the city having to do on this area before Streetscape. Mr. Walker noted that during the Streetscape renovations, this area has been negelected and if plantings were there, he would estimate two hours a week to maintain. He added when we ~~aredesigned~~ designing, there are factors they consider ~~and if it can be designed where it is to be~~ congruous with Streetscape, ~~and~~ it will be a lower maintainance ~~for us~~, and a lower cost ~~for helps~~ their department. Mr. Walker added when you have only a certain amount of men you can only do what your manpower allows you to do.
- Mr. Walker shared that the Trident trees are suitable for patios, planters, small yards and street side locations.
- Commissioner Yarborough stated the importance of the Horner Square Parking lot and his perception is to promote an area where it is beautified with flowers, plants and trees.

• It was noted that the commission did not received the application ahead of time and staff Whitmore relayed that there was problems with scanning the document, so Attorney Susan Patterson asked the applicant Fedd Walker to present by application. ~~(It should be noted the HPC staff shared with the HPC in her presentation the proposed plans for the island)~~

- Mr. Fedd Walker said he is proposing to use the same exact tree grates that are similar in design with Streetscape. Where the Trident trees will be planted there will be brick bands that will run around the interior of the island as well as concrete bands that will be placed across the island, dividing the island into five equal segments. He stated that he hasn't made a decision about what plant materials will be used around the Horner Square Parking lot sign.

Chair Nestor shared that people that park at the end of the parking lot going into Stanley's would walk through a planting area at the mailboxes being proposed; therefore, he likes the idea of the concrete being placed there.

Staff Whitmore stated what she is recommending is where the grate is that that area ~~that is a~~ 5 x 5 ft. area, which will be 25 sq. ft. will be outlined with metal edging and ~~planted with~~ Liriope ~~planted there~~ under each tree. (page 6) ~~(3 x 5 squares with Liriope planted there)~~ which will increase the impervious area by 50 percent of 75 sq.ft for another 37 sq.ft. for a total of 962 sq.ft. (96%) of impervious surface. ~~(Four percent of previous surface will remain if the project is installed as submitted.)~~ Staff noted that the unified development ordinance (Exhibit H, page 11) states that 150 square feet of open area be retained for planting trees. ~~Additionally the UDO states the following in regard to tree plantings (Exhibit H, page 10)~~ Applicant Fedd Walker wants to stick with tree grates. The length ~~of the planting island is approximately -will probably be around-~~ 150 ft. by ten foot wide. Susan Patterson stated that to clarify what staff Whitmore is saying is that staff would like to ~~idenified~~ ~~replace~~ the tree ~~grates~~ and put in planting materials. Applicant, Fedd Walker is asking for the tree grates to be placed to match what Streetscape already has. Staff Whitmore also added that we would like to see where the mailbox ~~is~~ and ~~the~~ Fed-x box ~~are located~~ -so it ~~to can be planted to mirror what is -will mirror what is being~~ planted at the other end ~~adjacent to Horner Blvd. and h~~ Her recommendation is ~~-with plantings on the other end with (Pink Mulhy Grass).~~ Applicant Fedd Walker would like to see the Fed-/X area concreted, so all the maintaince issues would be done at the corner of Horner and not deep into the lot. ~~Vegetation -will be planted at the end of the planting row and the one next to Horner which is already there.~~ Attorney Susan Patterson stated so the question is, ~~that~~ the board has to decide what is congruous, what's congruous with the Streetscape that has already been proposed for downtown, ~~or what is congruous or the potential for any other parking lot. We cannot demand the current UDO requirements; because the parking lot is grandfathered.~~

~~-knowing that you cannot demand it; because it is grandfathered in and then you will have to do it.~~
(Comments and questions that followed were:)

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 10 pt

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.5", Line spacing: Multiple 1.08 li, No bullets or numbering

Formatted: Indent: Left: 1", No bullets or numbering

- Commissioner Mitchell asked for an additional trash can to place in the Horner Square Parking lot.
- Chair Nestor, Commissioner Hughes and Commissioner Yarborough shared that they like the idea of concrete rather than plantings at the mailbox, and the Fed-X box due to lack of maintenance there, which would present a much cleaner look.
- Commissioner Stoch is in agreement with Staff Whitmore that since they will not be replacing tree per tree at the Horner Square Parking lot that he would like to see the three additional trees being proposed, planted in the corners of Depot Park.
- The city has a tree ordinance that recommends trees that are removed be planted elsewhere one to one; therefore staff Whitmore is requesting three trees to be planted on public property.
- Commissioner Mitchell asked if there was any maintenance involved as far as the grates and he wanted to know if the monument sign is here to stay. Staff Whitmore noted the monument sign could be changed out eventually.
- Commissioner Gordon added that what he is hearing, is that the plan is to have three tree planted with tree grates in the Horner Square parking lot and two light poles with two lights on each pole.
- It was noted that there is a certain requirement at the city's level and that is why staff Whitmore is wanting to place three other trees in Depot Park; but her preference would have been having the trees planted in the Horner Square Parking Lot.

Commissioner Mitchell asked if there was any maintenance involved as far as the grates and he wanted to know if the monument sign is here to stay. Staff noted the monument sign could be changed out eventually.

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 10 pt

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.5", Line spacing: Multiple 1.08 li, No bullets or numbering

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 10 pt

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.5", Line spacing: Multiple 1.08 li, No bullets or numbering

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 10 pt

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.5", Line spacing: Multiple 1.08 li, No bullets or numbering

- ~~Commissioner Gordon added that what he is hearing, is that the plan is to have three trees planted with tree grates in the Horner Square parking lot and two light poles with two lights each on them.~~

Formatted: Normal, No bullets or numbering

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 10 pt

- Chair Nestor asked to move forward as proposed by the city and he asked to remove any comments that he said prior about the UDO issues and he said we (the board) have to look at the proposal from the historic perception and how it becomes congruous with our Streetscape.

- Commissioner Stoch agreed too, that he would like to move forward as proposed by the city; but propose an amendent for the three other trees elsewhere.

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 10 pt

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.5", Line spacing: Multiple 1.08 li, No bullets or numbering

- Commissioner Yarborough noted that we are proposing more lighting.

Formatted: Indent: Left: 1", No bullets or numbering

- Attorney Patterson asked Chair Nestor not to specify the place in the motion and if you require extra plantings and if you try to define where, then it might not fit in the plans the city has ~~as to where to place them.~~ Chair Nestor and Attorney Susan Patterson agreed to let staff Whitmore determine where they ~~three additional trees should be planted, should be planted at that time.~~ Attorney Patterson shared that the requirement to replace one for one tree meets the tree ordinance; but she stated that she doesn't think you can always tell the applicant where to place it.

Formatted: Line spacing: single, Bulleted + Level: 1 + Aligned at: 0.75" + Indent at: 1"

Formatted: Indent: Left: 1", No bullets or numbering

FINDING OF FACT:

Commissioner Stoch stated in regards to COA- 16-42, Horner Square Parking Lot, I move that the Historic Preservation Commission find as fact that the installation of three (3) Trident maple trees with tree grates, the concreting of the entire island except for 75 square feet, installation of brick bands on the interior perimeter of

the entire island and brick bands that divide the concrete island into five equal segments, when completed in accordance with the Downtown Design Guidelines and the decision of Commission, is congruous with the character of the Historic District as the appurtenant features and fixtures (lighting, walls, fences, landscaping) of the proposed project are congruous to other such features found on the existing structures and landscapes or on other structures and landscapes in the district and the Streetscape and is generally in harmony with the criteria in the design guidelines, the special character of the neighboring properties, and the structures as a whole; along with three additional trees to replace three trees that ~~was taken out~~ were removed; to be placed in other areas of the city with staff Whitmore being able to approved the size and location of said additional trees; seconded by commissioner Yarborough and it passed unanimously.

FINAL MOTIONS:

Commissioner Stoch stated based on the preceding finding(s) of fact, I move that the Historic Preservation Commission grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to the City of Sanford for the installation of three (3) Trident maple trees with tree grates, ~~the~~ concreting ~~of~~ the entire island except for 75 square feet, installation of brick bands on the interior perimeter of the entire island and brick bands that divide the concrete island into five equal segments, as shown in COA-16-42, Horner Square Parking Lot, along with three additional trees to be placed somewhere else in the city, preferable downtown but not required; with location and size to be approved by staff Whitmore at that time; seconded by commissioner Mitchell and it passed unanimously.

Chair Nestor at this time mentioned to Susan Patterson, city attorney that Mr. Benschoff would like to see the ~~Find~~ding of Fact and the Final Motion all in one. She said you need to have a Finding of Fact and then you need to have an order. Mrs. Patterson said she would talk with Mr. Benschoff. They are two separate actions. The final motion is to grant the COA or table the COA or put a condition on the COA.

Mr. Fedd Walker leaves at this time.

6. Old Business:

a. ACTION TO BE TAKEN ON THE FOLLOWING AMENDMENT: Staff Whitmore stated that the commission had discussed at the February's meeting about the awnings in downtown and an amendment for a revision to the downtown guidelines. She stated it hasn't changed and what was proposed for the awnings in the downtown district is it should not extend more than five feet from the building façade as long as there is no interference with trees. Staff Whitmore asked everyone to look at pages 24 and 25. She stated on page 25, under signs and awnings, after the first bullet point the language states ~~"The~~ location of new signage and awnings of commercial buildings shall conform with the appropriate placement of signs and awnings on historical buildings." Staff stated that this is what she would recommend the revision be to the downtown guidelines. Staff stated that it is on the agenda, and she wasn't aware that the commission members did not have pages 24 and 25. City Attorney asked staff Whitmore if she was just adding this sentence to what is already there and she said yes. Chair Nestor called for a motion. Commissioner Mitchell moved to make a motion for a revision to the downtown guidelines as stated on page 25; ~~liz had copy.?? pertaining to change that the awnings be approved;~~ seconded by commissioner Yarborough and it passed unanimously. City attorney Susan Patterson asked staff Whitmore if she has checked to see how many awnings are there that extend more than five feet or how many are grandfathered in and staff noted that there are none. Chair Nestor said that he felt like Super Ten store, Kimbrells and the Temple Theatre may extend more than five; but staff Whitmore noted that this applies only to new awnings.

Staff Whitmore asked the commission if they would be ok with having our monthly meetings at the Buggy building. No definite decision was made. Commissioner Gordon shared that he did get a view of the train coming through Depot Park and he noticed that the tree branches were interfering when the train passed. He said he is good with taking the Bradford Pears down along the railroad track on Moore Street. Commissioner Stoch was also in agreement and staff noted that this COA has been tabled until the November meeting. Staff Whitmore asked the board; since they don't have any cases coming before the board for the regularly scheduled October 24th meeting and it has already passed the submittal date for ~~COA~~COA's if they would like to ~~skip~~cancel that meeting and resume the next meeting for November 28th. - Chair Nestor asked staff Whitmore to cancel the October 28th meeting and everyone was in agreement.

7. Adjournement:

Chair David Nestor called for adjournment. Commissioner Gordon moved to adjourn; seconded by Commissioner Stoch and the motion passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 8:15 pm.

Adopted this ____ day of _____ 2016

Respectfully submitted:

Chair: David Nestor/ Vice-Chair – Brian Mitchell

Attest: _____
Secretary to the Board: Anne Sears